

Visual Representations of Constantinople/Istanbul and other Images in Mural Paintings and Artifacts of the Late Ottoman Centuries in Albania

Dorina Arapi

Ulusal Tarih Müzesi Arnavutluk

Due to its geographical position, historical events and social circumstances, Albania has served as a crossroad to great empires. For centuries different cultural influences were encountered and a network of ideas, perceptions and concepts created interesting strata of imaginary boundaries, proximity and remoteness. Albania was strategically located; via Egnatia that led from Dyrrhachium (modern Durrës, Albania) to Constantinople served as a east-west route and for a long time was known as “the main artery of the byzantine heart”.¹ Over the centuries, the Byzantine Constantinople and the Ottoman Istanbul were perceived as the main cultural centers to be linked and related to. Constantinople spread its influence on Byzantine culture in Albania over the many centuries. Following the downfall of the Eastern Roman Empire in 1453, the tradition of

.....

1 Pëllumb Xhufi, “Ndarja e Shqipërisë nga Bizanti”, in *Studime historike*, Akademia e Shkencave e Republikës së Shqipërisë, Instituti i Historisë, Tiranë, 1-2 (1999), p. 24.

Haremlik
Kaplan Paşa



making icons by following the rules of the Christian orthodox art still prevailed.² This period, known as the era of Post Byzantine art, entered into a new phase. Innovation in iconography was enriched with new artistic elements. The Ottoman Empire conquered Albania in the fifteenth century and its cultural influence affected many aspects of Albanian cultural life. Despite local traditions, Ottoman visual culture had an impact on local culture, especially in introducing models of visual representation, new themes in mural paintings and new patterns of decorations. Therefore, during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, decorative elements, urban and architectonic landscapes, picturesque scenes of Istanbul were incorporated into the composition of the mosques and houses.

Byzantine Constantinople and Ottoman Istanbul was the “super-city”³ which embodied major changes. The two empires attempt-

.....

² Lyn Rodley, “The Byzantine Context”, Angeliki Lymberopoulou and Rembrandt Duits (eds.), *Byzantine Art and Reinnassance Europe* (Ashgate, 2013), p. 34.

³ Speros Vryonis, Jr., “Byzantine Constantinople and Ottoman Istanbul.

ed to bring the city into the spotlight of their policies; it is therefore quite understandable that the city occupied a special place in the wall decoration of the feudal houses, and wealthy houses. During the eighteenth and nineteenth century, the visual representation of Istanbul turned to be the most used iconographic theme, becoming a symbol of affiliation. The origin of this visual expression should be traced back to the eighteenth century when Istanbul underwent major changes. Following the stay of the imperial family in Edirne for 40 years, Sultan Ahmed III settled in Istanbul and re-inaugurated it as the capital of the empire. As a period marked by reformation, the “Ottoman rule forged a new image for itself, based on visibility”.⁴ The transformetre of the city took place not only in its layout, but also in the establishment of many architectural buildings as kiosks, summer palaces, gardens and fountains.⁵ The reign of Ahmed III as a period of revitalization of the public life and the city itself, returned “Istanbul to its central position as capital of the empire”.⁶

The image of Istanbul should not be sought only in architectural landscapes; it appears in symbols and figurations that remind of its power and enchantment. In the accounts of many scholars, the iconographic theme of Istanbul in wall paintings was firstly displayed in the mansions of the sultan since the early seventeenth century.⁷ Studies conducted in Albania, generally stipulate that the images present in the mosques are usually imitations of those in Istanbul,

.....

Evolution in a Millennial Imperial Iconography”, eds. Irene A. Bierman, Rifa’at Ali Abou-El-Haj, Donald Preziosi, *The Ottoman City and its Parts: Urban Structure and Social Order*, Aristide D. Caratzas (New York, 1991), p. 13-52.

- 4 Ipek Tureli, “Istanbul”, in Sandy Isenstadt, Margaret Maile Petty, Dietrich Neumann (eds.) *Cities of Light: Two Centuries of Urban Illumination*, (Taylor and Francis, New York, 2015), p. 3.
- 5 Shirine Hamadeh, “Splash and Spectacle: The Obsession with Fountains in Eighteenth-century Istanbul”, *Muqarnas: An Annual on the Visual Culture of the Islamic World*, Vol. 19 (2002): pp. 123-148.
- 6 Ebru Boyar and Kate Fleet, *A Social History of Ottoman Istanbul*, (Cambridge, New York, 2010), p. 3.
- 7 Carel Bertram, *Imagining the Turkish House: Collective Visions of Home*, (Austin, Texas, 2008), p. 43.

İstanbul,
Haremlik
Kaplan Paşa



and commonly found in the houses of central Albania.⁸ Mosques in Albania were financed by wealthy landlords or merchants, following the example of sultans and viziers in Istanbul.⁹

.....

8 Pirro Thomo, “Aspekte të njësisë dhe ndryshueshmërisë në trashëgiminë ndërtimore të vendeve fqinje”, *Albanohellenica*, 5 (2013), p. 283.

9 Koço Miho, “Kontributi i traditës vendëse në arkitekturën e xhamise tipike të Tiranës”, *Monumentet*, II (1976), p. 192.

One of the earliest mural painting dates back to the eighteenth century, precisely 1764, the year that also marks the construction of the house.¹⁰ The fresco is depicted in the *haremlik* of Kaplan Pasa Toptan (today the Ethnographic museum of Krujë), which is located in the city of Krujë. The Toptan family was a well-known feudal family in Albania in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. They had extensive territories in Krujë and performed different functions in the feudal administration and in the imperial court of Istanbul.¹¹ The Toptans were described as a important family, and their relations with influential people in the Sultan's court aided in maintaining their dominance as well as solving their conflicts with the Bargjinoll family, a feudal family of Tiranë.

In the haremlik, mural paintings decorate the bride's room's upper part walls. Here, there is what appear to be the visual representation of a wrestling match, an urban landscape, two lions and an emblem. Istanbul usually appears as surrounded by the sea, and other figures on mural paintings display vessels on the banks, mansions along the coast and cypress trees. The city that appears on the mural painting might be the city of Istanbul. This might be for two reasons: the first, this iconographic theme was ubiquitous during that period; and the second is related to the close ties that the Toptan family had with Istanbul, with the Sultan's court; the representation of Istanbul on the mural painting was a further proof of the family's power. The urban landscape shows the city walls and various houses with *çardak*. This might be a scene from the Golden Horn and the depiction of the ships reinforces this idea. As the main entrance to the city, until the nineteenth century, Golden Horn served as a shipyard, used for building ships, and as a port where different goods from various countries and the Balkans arrived.¹² What attracts the attention in this painting is the portrayal of a steam boat. Presuming

.....

10 Emin Riza, "Studim për restaurimin e një banese me çardak në qytetin e Krujës", *Monumentet*, Tiranë, 9 (1975), pp. 107-126.

11 For the family of Toptans and Bargjinoll, see : Kristo Frashëri, "Historia e Tiranës", *Tiranë*, (2004), pp. 104-116.

12 Dikmen Bezmez, *The Politics of Urban Regeneration: The Case of the Golden Horn, Istanbul*, (United States, 2008), p. 125.

Suleymaniye,
in Et'hem
Beu mosque,
Tirana



that it was started to be used in the Ottoman Empire in 1827,¹³ the illustration of the steam boat invalidates the idea that the painting was done in 1764, thus leading us to think that it was done years later.

Another represented scene is the wrestling match, the game of *pehlivans*. This activity was performed during the wedding events (still present in Macedonia and Gora),¹⁴ therefore it is understandable why it appears in the bride's room. Near the scene of *pehlivans* are depicted two lions. According to the oral tradition, the two images of lions are related to the Toptan family, representing the family's coat of arms.¹⁵

.....

¹³ Selcuk Aksin Somel, *The A to Z of the Ottoman Empire*, (UK, 2003), p. IX.

¹⁴ Parim Kosova, *Gora dhe veshja tradicionale e saj gjatë shekullit XX*, (Prishtinë, 2007), p. 18; Goranco Angelov, "The Function of the Zurla Players in the Pehlivan Wrestling in some parts of the Republic of Macedonia", in *Fourth Symposium of the ICTM study group for music and dance in Southeastern Europe*, (Serbia, 2014).

¹⁵ The portrayal of lions is present in many mural paintings of Gjirokaštër houses, and Konitsa houses (Greece), which makes us think that the traveler painters preferred certain figurations, and therefore in some houses appear the same elements.

The last scene is the representation of an emblem, which is very simple in its symbolic organization. The placement of the emblem on mural paintings of Toptan haremluk coincides with the new measures that were taken by the Ottoman Empire in the late eighteenth century; the renewal of the military system is associated with the military image as the emblem. It is not clear when exactly the first official coat of arms was designed for the Ottoman Empire;¹⁶ however, this image indicates the importance of this family and it represents one of the initial forms of the Ottoman emblems that appear on mural paintings in Albania. Given the close relations that the Toptan family had with the Sultan's court, it would be acceptable to think that this emblem suggests the high esteem and prestige this house held in the eyes of the Ottoman state.¹⁷ There are depicted zurlas, drums (local musical instruments), flags and weapons. Their way of organization makes us think that it is a combination of local and military elements, and an indicator of this family status.

Among many mosques built in Tiranë, the most beautiful one (still located in the center of the city), is the Hacı Et'hem Beu mosque. Its construction was started in 1793/94 by Molla Bey and it was finished by his son Hacı Et'hem Bey in 1822/23.¹⁸ The mural paintings date 1822/23.¹⁹

In the prayer hall, walls and domes are covered with mural paintings.²⁰ Exterior walls of the mosque's portico and the mural painting of the façade portray Istanbul. According to Kristo Frashëri, in the painting of the mosque's portico it is portrayed an island with a river that flows through it where the boats sail. In one of the

.....
 16 [http://www.obarsiv.com/english/Ottoman Orders and Decorations.html](http://www.obarsiv.com/english/Ottoman%20Orders%20and%20Decorations.html)

17 See and compare Tarkan Okcuoğlu, "Between Tradition and Modernity: The Kayserili Ahmed Pasha Mansion and its Wall Paintings", *Synergies Turquie no 2, Regards Sur une Langue-Culture, Istanbul*, (2009): pp. 41-50.

18 Koço Miho, "Kontributi i traditës vendëse në arkitekturën e xhamisë tipike të Tiranës", *Monumentet*, II (1976), p. 193.

19 Machiel Kiel, *Arkitektura osmane në Shqipëri 1385-1912*, (Tiranë, 2012), p. 319.

20 Stilian Adhami, *Monumente të kulturës në Shqipëri*, (Tiranë, 1958), p. 160; Apollon Baçe, Aleksandër Meksi, Gjerak Karaiskaj, Pirro Thomo, *Historia e arkitekturës shqiptare. Nga fillimet deri ne 1912*, Tiranë, 1979-1980, p. 351.

chronograms in the mosque, it is written that “the mosque has given eternal beauty to the city, as Hagia Sophia has given to Istanbul”. The author of the verses recalls the idea of Hagia Sophia, which does not appear on mural paintings. The identification of Süleymaniye mosque with Hagia Sophia is almost understandable. The Süleymaniye mosque, positioned on the third hill, dominated the skyline of the city of Istanbul. Under the image of the glorious former Byzantine basilica of Hagia Sophia, the Süleymaniye mosque was seen as a “progeny of the Hagia Sophia”.²¹ In this context, the Süleymaniye seems to stand out in Istanbul’s skyline silhouette.

An element that serves as a determining factor in the identification of the mosques is the number of minarets.²² The juxtaposition of comprehensive elements of the city and the depiction of cypress trees and stone buildings with çardak, which appear in the same order and repeated in the same manner, creates an aesthetically pleasing effect. In the interior part of the Et’hem Bey mosque, on the eastern side of the prayer hall and in the prayer area of women, Süleymaniye mosque is shown among other landscapes, with its four minarets as it appears in the Bachelors’ mosque in Berat.²³ The Süleymaniye mosque was a distinctive landmark and the most representative subject of the city.²⁴ Most of the scenes that appear in mural paintings

.....

21 See: Fairchild D Ruggles, “Süleymaniye Mosque,” ed. Joseph W. Meri, in *Medieval Islamic Civilization. An Encyclopedia*, New York and London: Routledge Vol. I, (2006): pp. 778-780.

22 Carel Bertram, *Imagining the Turkish House: Collective Visions of Home*, Austin, (Texas, 2008), p. 44.

23 This mosque was built in 1827 and its construction was ordered by Suleyman Pasa Vlora. Since it served guild single city, the mosque is known as mosque named Bachelors. The wall painting date 1827/1828. See: Machiel Kiel, *Arkitektura osmane në Shqipëri 1385-1912*, (Tiranë, 2012); On the mural paintings of the eastern façade of the Bachelors Mosque in Berat it is depicted a landscape showing the Süleymaniye Mosque in Istanbul city. See: Dorina Arapi, *Uji në arte dhe zejтари në rajonin e Beratit, nga shek. IV para Krishtit deri në shek. XIX pas Krishtit*, (University of New York, Tirana, 2015). (Forthcoming).

24 See: Carel Bertram, *Imagining the Turkish House: Collective Visions of Home*, (Austin, Texas, 2008), p. 44.

are not realistic paintings, but imaginary scenes that recall scenes and architectonic landscapes, such as the Süleymaniye mosque, the tower of Beyazid, the Bosphorus and the Golden Horn.²⁵ The account of the Italian architect Baglioni (around the 40's), describes that on the west wall of the Suleyman Pasa mosque in Tiranë (destroyed during the WWII) it is depicted "Constantinople in details as the Saray, the mosques, and the Theodosius Column".²⁶ It seems that important monuments of the city were the subject of the wall paintings.

Given the similarity of the paintings in the prayer hall of the mosque of Et'hem Bey with those in the prayer hall of the Bachelors mosque in Berat, it can be supposed that not only they may have been painted by the same master, but also common templates might have been used.²⁷ Unlike the prayer hall, numerous landscapes decorate the portico of Et'hem Bey Mosque, but the mural paintings style is not the same with these of the prayer hall's muals of the prayer hall. It is clearly evident that they are not the same group of artists that worked in the prayer hall. The mural paintings in the portico represent a higher level of painting. There might have been artists with a certain artistic background, using the perspective despite being limited. Painters somehow follow the rules of perspective, but in most cases they avoided it. The distinctive pictorial style, the interpretation of paintings and drawings and the treatment of shape and volume suggest that there might have been two different groups of painters with a certain artistic background. It is argued that similar interior stylistic features of old Turkish buildings (preserved in Veroia, Kastoria, Smolyan, and Anatolia) indicate that the same group of artists,

.....

²⁵ Bertren, *Imaging the Turkish Horse*, p. 43; Carel Bertram, *Imagining the Turkish House: Collective Visions of Home*, Austin, Texas, 2008, p. 43.

²⁶ E. Baglioni, *Tirana e dintorni in Albania-Guida della consociazione turistica italiana*, (Milano, 1940), p. 151.

²⁷ See: Helmut Buschhausen, Chary Chotzakoglou, "La posizione della pittura Albanese nell'arte bizantina e postbizantina", Mustafa Arapi, Karoline Czerwenka-Papadopoulos (eds.), *Icone di Albania. Arte Sacra dal XIV al XIX Secolo. Albania tra la Mezzaluna e la Croce*, Catalogo della Mostra, Aprile – Giugno 2002, Mole Vanvitelliana di Ancona, 106-7 (No. 69) Ancona: Provincia di Ancona, 2002, pp. 29-48.

The emblem



who had been in Macedonia and Northern Greece, painted them.²⁸ Inside the mosque there is a naive depiction, and in the portico of the mosque were a group of painters, who had a well-rounded knowledge of the art of painting, although an empirical knowledge in the usage of perspective.

Since it was not possible to follow the rules of the perspective, the visual expression of Istanbul was imaginary rather than being captured *en plein air*. There were frequent attempts to represent a part of the city in the form of an island as it appeared in the portico of the Et'hem bey mosque. The artist was oriented toward the idea of the city on seven hills where every hill had its monument. Depictions always recall important monuments that serve as points of reference for the viewer. The foundation of Constantinople as the New Rome inspired the idea of city the with seven hills. Because of the city's topography and the artistic aspect, the city resembles island-like hills, as it appears in the portico Et'hem bey mosque.

.....
 28 Machiel Kiel, *Arkitektura osmane në Shqipëri 1385-1912*, (Tiranë, 2012), p. 319.

The way Istanbul appears in the mural paintings of Et'hem bey Mosque is pertinent reminds us of the engravings of eighteenth and nineteenth cultures, such as for example, the engravings of Martin Sturtzenbecher, Ludwig McFarlane and Charles Wrangel.²⁹ We do not know if/how these engravings ended up in the hands of the artists, but if we take into consideration that most of the paintings were executed by travel painters, we can assume that they came into contact with such engravings.

For the post byzantine art it was somehow different. The icons, as holy images, had a spiritual function. They could make the believer assimilate the contents of religious texts through image. So the artist had to follow the idea and not the reality. The canonic rules of Byzantine art helped the believer to understand the scenes from holy texts through the depiction of saints, portraits and nature. Everything was painted far from reality, not a materialistic referring to world, it was "indifferent towards the faithful depiction of the sensible world and that it favored the reproduction of established iconographies types".³⁰

A particular iconographic theme of the later Orthodox Christian art in Albania shows in the background of the icon the city of Constantinople with its transformation. The former Constantinople is depicted; but significant elements from the Islamic mosques are incorporated, such as of the Islamic mosques, as the minarets³¹ that rise high above in Constantinople's skyline.

.....

²⁹ For a comparison and analysis see the engravings: Martin Sturtzenbecher, *Vue de Constantinople prise du palais de suède à Pera 1791*; Charles Mac Farlane, *Constantinople in 1828. A residence of sixteen months in the Turkish capital and provinces: with an account of the present state of the naval and military power, and of the resources of the Ottoman Empire*, (London, 1829); Ludwig Wrangel, *Flüchtige skizzen aus ost und süd, gesammelt auf einer reise nach wosnesensk*, (Odessa, Constantinopel, Smyrna, Athen und Corfu, 1839).

³⁰ Maria G. Parani, *Reconstructing the Reality of Images. Byzantine Material Culture and Religious Iconography (11th-15th Centuries)*, (Brill, Leiden, Boston, 2003), p. 2.

³¹ Myslim Hotova, *Besimi dhe Qytetërimi. Bashkëudhëtarë*, (Tiranë, 2011, U.F.O Press), pp. 180-182.

The Icon “The Life-Giving Spring” is painted in the workshop of Joan Çetiri.³² The iconographic theme of “The Life-Giving Spring” (Zoodochos Pighi) is related to the church that bears the same name with that in Constantinople. During the Ottoman period it seemed as if there were fish in the pond and the entire neighborhood was named Balukli or Balıklı, meaning “fish pond” in Turkish.³³ The fish are related to a legend about a monk in the Balıklı monastery. The legend tells that the monk was frying the fish when he heard the news that Constantinople was captured by the Turks; he said that he would believe it only if those fish started to swim in the life-giving spring, something that actually happened.³⁴ Several later icons of “The Life-Giving Spring” depicted fish in the pond. The monastery was revived after two reconstructions, respectively in 1727 and 1835,³⁵ and the fame of the icon spread to those places with healing sites.³⁶ Based on the rules that define the Byzantine art, in the icon’s background appear buildings that portray Constantinople

.....

32 The story about a soldier named Leo, which goes back around the year 450 AD, outside the Byzantine city walls of Constantinople. Suddenly Leo sees before him a blind guy, who was asking water to quench his thirst. A woman’s voice spoke to him saying that the water is near you. Leo followed her advice and came just as he heard the voice; the blind regained sight and he beat thirst. Years later Leo would become King her as Leo I, and to honor the name of Holy Mother Theotokos, built a church on the name of the life-giving spring. On the icon is depicted the Virgin holding the Christ Child placed on a fountain. All the figures are gathered around her and the fountain which she approached to be headed in the miraculas water.

33 Jens Fleischer, The Mother of God –The Life-Giving Fountain, in Søren Kaspersen, Ulla Haastrup (eds.), *Images of Cult and Devotion Function and Reception of Christian Images in Medieval and Post-Medieval Europe*, (Museum Tusculanum Press and the authors, Copenhagen, 2004), pp. 255-264.

34 Alfredo Tradigo, *Icone e Santi d’Oriente, Mondadori Electa*, (Milano, 2004), p. 193.

35 Moutafov Emmanuel, “Monastery of the Zoodochos Pege at Balıklı, extra muros”, *Encyclopaedia of the Hellenic World*, Constantinople, URL: <<http://kassiani.fhw.gr/l.aspx?id=11780>>

36 Andreas Andreopoulos, *Gazing on God: Trinity, Church and Salvation in Orthodox Thought and Iconography*, (Cambridge, United Kingdom, 2013), p. 96.

in a simple way. The depiction of the mosques minarets in this icon is a rare representation of this iconographic theme.³⁷

The representation of Constantinople in this icon might be related to the changes in image, the architectural landscape of Constantinople and the monastery itself, which might be linked to the changes that the city encountered during the eighteenth century. In that century, the fountains were a central feature of visual and literary representations of Istanbul, and the proliferation of fountains and elegant architectural embellishment of watering places in the eighteenth century was widespread.³⁸ This change found resonance also in the Orthodox Christian world. The representation of Islamic elements in objects of devotion among Orthodox Christians implies that this scene was permitted in Constantinople. From 1703 until 1809, around 370 fountains and 250 çesmes were built in different areas of the city.³⁹ The large number of constructions that featured these architectonic elements had either an aesthetic function or a spiritual one. During the eighteenth century, there was a revaluation of the pagan elements, as it was believed that the water had an mystical aspect. The idea of the water as a mystical element was used as a religious triumph as well.⁴⁰ This led to the construction of many fountains and a desire to decorate with architectonic elements the places with healing water.⁴¹ This trend was reflected in the Christian

.....

37 Myslim Hotova, *Besimi dhe Qytetërimi. Bashkëndhëtarë*, (Tiranë, 2011), U.F.O Press, pp. 180–182. According to Hotova, this icon represents the religious tolerance in Albania. Another icon, dating the first half of nineteenth century, is “The life-giving spring” of Mihal Anagnosti. The central figure is the Holy Mother and the Christ child who stand on a marble fountain. On the background of the icon is depicted the city of Constantinople with the city walls. The depiction of Constantinople seems to be more related to a “realistic” depiction of the walls. As the legend says, the history takes place near the Golden Gate in Constantinople.

38 Bradley, *Water*, p. 125.

39 Shirine Hamadeh, “Splash and Spectacle: The Obsession with Fountains in Eighteenth-century Istanbul”, *Muqarnas: An Annual on the Visual Culture of the Islamic World*, Vol. 19 (2002), pp. 123–148.

40 Bradley, *Water*, p. 126.

41 Bradley, *Water*, p. 125.



Orthodox icons as well as in the fountains and *çesmes*. The placement of the high minarets on the architectonic landscape of Constantinople shows that the monastery with healing spring was a destination for not only Christians pilgrimage, but also for Muslims.⁴² The spread of this iconography and the idea of the water as a religious triumph is strongly connected to the idea of the revival of the church during the eighteenth century which considers the water as a political triumph as well.⁴³ The idea of the universal church is reflected in the rare iconographic theme of “The First Ecumenical Council the Battle of Mulvian Bridge”.⁴⁴ Also the appearance in the post Byzantine iconography of Saint Constantine with the scepter seem

.....
 42 Basilius J. Groen, “Wash your sins, not only your face”: Therapeutic Water and the Evolution of the Small Water Blessing in the Greek-Byzantine Tradition, in Eds Diliانا Atanassova,” in Tinatin Chronz (Hg.) *Beiträge zu Gottesdienst und Geschichte der fünf altkirchlichen Patriarchate für Heinzgerd Brakmannzum 70, Geburtstag Orientalia–Patristica–Oecumenica* Vol.6, 2, (Lit Verlag GmbH and Co. KG, Wien, 2014), p. 259.

43 Bradley, *Water*, p. 126.

44 The icon was painted by Joan Athanasi in 1765.

to be related to the spiritual awaking of the church in the eighteenth century.⁴⁵ After the abolishment of the autocephalous archdioceses in the eighteenth century, the ecumenical ideology was seen as an idea to raise the religious spiritual awakening of the church and the restoration of the Byzantine Empire.⁴⁶ As a result, the transmission of this idea was translated into symbolic figures such as Saint Constantine.

The dynamism of Constantinople is embodied in all the artistic changes of the time, as well as the relationship and cultural exchanges between them. In one way or another, the city had been a meeting point, the beating heart for both empires. Due to its geographical position, political importance, the city was the perfect matrix for “the imperial iconography”,⁴⁷ as Vryonis would say.

-
- 45 For an iconography of Saint Constantine see: *Ioannis P. Chouliarás*, “The Depiction of Saint Constantine in Postbyzantine Monumental Art in Epirus and Macedonia. Iconographical Particularities,” in Miša Rakocija (ed.) in *Niš and Byzantium*, (Nis, 2014), pp. 433-442.
- 46 Eleonora Naxidou, “The Transition from Ecumenical Tradition to a Multinational Perspective: The Historical Evolution of the Orthodox Church in the Ottoman Empire” Plamen Mitev, Ivan Parvev, Maria Baramova, Vania Racheva (eds.), *Empires and Peninsulas: Southeastern Europe between Karlowitz and the Peace of Adrianople, 1699-1829*, Lit Verlag Dr. W. Hopf, Berlin, 2010, pp. 149-152.
- 47 Speros Vryonis, Jr., “Byzantine Constantinople and Ottoman Istanbul. Evolution in a Millennial Imperial Iconography,” Irene A. Bierman, Rifa‘at Ali Abou-El-Haj, Donald Preziosi (eds.), *The Ottoman City and its Parts: Urban Structure and Social Order*, (Aristide D. Caratzas, New York, 1991), pp. 13-52.

